



UNC
GREENSBORO
Board of Trustees

Meeting of the Full Board
February 22, 2024
8:30 am
Oakley Family Reception Room, UNCG Alumni House
DRAFT MINUTES

Members Present: George Hoyle, Chair; Mae Douglas, Vice Chair; Linda Sloan, Secretary; Anita Bachmann, Margaret Benjamin, Oita Coleman, Ernest Grant, Dale Phipps, Dean Priddy, Tim Rice (participated remotely); Tim Sessions, Awa Mbai

Members Absent with Notice: David Brown

Others Present: Chancellor Frank Gilliam; Provost Debbie Storrs; Bob Shea, Vice Chancellor for Finance & Administration; Jerry Blakemore, Vice Chancellor for Institutional Integrity and General Counsel; Cathy Akens, Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs; Beth Fischer, Vice Chancellor for University Advancement; Donna Heath, Vice Chancellor for Information Technology; Tina McEntire, Vice Chancellor for Enrollment Management; Terri Shelton, Vice Chancellor for Research and Engagement; Jeanne Madorin, Associate Vice Chancellor and Chief Human Resources Officer; Brian Mackin, Director of Athletics; Kristen Bonatz, Deputy General Counsel; Waiyi Tse, Chief of Staff, Kelly Harris, Assistant Secretary to the Board of Trustees; and other members of the faculty, staff, and general public.

Welcome, Conflict of Interest Statement, and Roll Call

Chair George Hoyle called the meeting to order at 8:30 am. He read the Conflict of Interest Statement; none were identified. Roll call was read, and a quorum was confirmed.

Chair's Remarks

Chair Hoyle reflected on the System Workshop and Board of Governors meetings held on campus in November, noting that the positive exposure and recognition UNCG received that week was significant. During that week, Trustees consistently heard System and BOG leadership lift up what we are doing as a university in terms of strategic priorities and success measures.

He also highlighted several examples of recent national recognition the university has received.

- The School of Education's Master's of Library and Information Science program in the Department of Information, Library, and Research Sciences has been ranked the 9th best program nationally and number 1 in North Carolina. To receive this ranking, the graduation rate has to be in the top third of all reporting schools. Other criteria include affordability, student outcomes, reputation, diversity, and social mobility.

- The Foundation for Individual Rights and Expression (FIRE) just issued its 2024 college free speech rankings and put UNCG at No. 1 in North Carolina for free speech on campus, and 9th in the nation. The rankings were based on the voices of more than 55,000 students from 248 colleges and universities. Prospective students and their parents consider factors like this in choosing where to enroll.
- Twenty-six faculty from several disciplines have been named among the top 2% most-cited researchers world-wide according to the 2023 Stanford Elsevier List, which looks at career-wide citation numbers as well as excellence in the most recent year of available data (2022).
- School of Nursing Dean Debra Barksdale has been selected as president-elect of the American Academy of Nursing, the country's top honorific organization for nurses. Fellows of the Academy represent nursing's most accomplished leaders in policy, research, administration, practice, and academia. Trustee Ernest Grant is also a member of the Academy.

Hoyle offered congratulations to everyone involved in garnering such stellar recognition.

Chancellor's Remarks

Academic Portfolio Review. Chancellor Gilliam mentioned a recent Op-Ed in support of leadership and the Academic Portfolio Review that Chair Hoyle and three previous BOT Chairs, all of whom are alumni, wrote in the *Greensboro News and Record*. He expressed his thanks and appreciation for the ongoing support.

Gilliam also recognized and thanked Provost Debbie Storrs for taking on the difficult task of conducting the review and doing so in a positive and firm way, driven by her commitment to doing the right thing for the institution. She continues to reject the “us versus them” narrative; she advocates for our faculty at the System level and is not afraid to make decisions. He noted that we – the students, staff, administration, and faculty – are lucky to have her as Provost.

Budget. Gilliam reported that in our running start to 2024, significant progress has been made toward tackling budget challenges to reinforce the University's long-term foundation. The University saw a loss of \$8.3 million in enrollment-based state appropriations for the current fiscal year. This decline stemmed from cohort drag and a new model that reduces state funding for graduate education. Some of the loss was mitigated through performance metrics appropriations (\$2.4 Million), and a one-time stop loss Gilliam pursued through the Board of Governors and the Legislature that saved \$2.3 million.

The balance of the shortfall was accounted for by employing several measures:

- a disciplined approach to filling open positions, using a dual-approval process;
- a reduction in administrators and administrative staff; and
- reductions in staffing through unit reorganizations to improve efficiency and work quality.

More must be done to address the headwinds facing the university. One such example is the work of the Task Force on Financial Sustainability. Many campus leaders have been inspired to take action since the Task Force Report was released in summer 2023.

Two recommendations from the report are being implemented at the university level. First, we will resume a review of select unrestricted and obsolete endowments. Funds will be reallocated when appropriate and consistent with donor intent. Another task-force recommendation concerns strategic workforce reorganization, including opportunities to centralize functions that may be duplicated across the university. To that end, we will conduct a university-wide comprehensive organizational and operational assessment of marketing and communications functions, which will inform a recommendation for an organizational model. Our goal is to ensure university-wide communications alignment, reduce redundancy and cost, and improve overall effectiveness of marketing and communications.

Going Forward. Gilliam reported that the university's north star remains the same – access and excellence. Our vision is that UNCG will be the university that provides access and opportunity to the broadest array of students, providing them with an excellent education by focusing on a suite of programs carefully tailored to support their self-discovery and intellectual growth. We will prepare our students for the 21st century workforce, produce scholarship that is theoretical, applied, and community engaged, at the lowest total cost possible. This vision corresponds to a dynamic global and national environment. As the world changes, we must adjust our strategy of implementing the vision. That is what is underway now. Dr. Andrew Hamilton, Dean of Undergraduate Studies, will present on the university's System-assigned performance metrics, which are one important aspect of that process.

Gilliam also recognized Professor Wade Maki, who currently serves as the UNC Faculty Assembly Chair. Gilliam has appointed Maki to lead the revision of the strategic plan. He will develop a process to update our plan that incorporates the System's plan and metrics, the funding model, and other strategic considerations. Our intention is to use these tools as guidelines to catalog and measure the impact of our strategy.

Gilliam closed by noting that in all, leadership is responsible for the university's future viability. That sometimes requires that decisions must be made that may not be appealing to some individuals or groups of individuals. That is to be expected, and it can cause angst. No one feels good about making cuts that threaten people's livelihoods. However, the level of transparency, the public release of data, and the community engagements that have been priorities during the process speak directly to a thoughtful and clear process. Leadership will continue to be clear-eyed as we move forward.

Committee Reports

Finance and Administration Committee

Committee Chair Tim Rice reported on the February 20, 2024 meeting of the Finance and Administration Committee.

Vice Chancellor Bob Shea and AVC Sameer Kapileswari updated the Finance and Administration Committee on deferred maintenance challenges and escalating construction costs. Deferred maintenance backlog continues to be a topic of conversation and concern in most facilities management professional organizations. According to a report release by the Association of

Physical Plant Administrators (APPA), in collaboration with Sightlines, the average school now has about \$133/gsf in renewal needs, significantly higher than their previous report of \$105/gsf. Over 31% of UNCG's buildings fall in the 1970-89 and 1990-99 construction ranges and are up for comprehensive renewal, considering a 25-year equipment and system life cycle.

The Committee also heard information on construction market volatility and challenges related to the labor pool shortage. The average increase in construction wages from 2021 to 2023 has been around 20%. The rise of mega projects (those with construction budgets exceeding \$1 billion) continues to overwhelm resources, especially labor. Several mega projects dominate the country's eastern half, particularly between Michigan and Georgia, including North Carolina. Graphs charting labor supply and demand since the 1980s show how these curves have collided for the first time in over 40 years. Conversation was also had around the impact of increased natural gas and electric utility rates.

The Committee received information about projects completed during fiscal year 2022-23 and voted to accept final completion of those projects pursuant to delegated authority. The Committee recommended the request for final acceptance to the full Board of Trustees.

The meeting concluded with a presentation of information on current design and construction projects and projects approved by the Chancellor pursuant to delegated authority.

Compliance, Audit, Risk Management, & Legal Committee (CARL)

Committee Chair Anita Bachmann reported on the February 20, 2024 meeting of the CARL Committee.

Director of Internal Audit Katherine Skinner reviewed results of several audits, including a financial statement audit conducted by the Office of the State Auditor. It resulted in no findings and an opinion that the statements were presented fairly in all material respects.

Chief Information Security Office Casey Forrest provided an update on the University's cybersecurity program and the university's efforts to protect against cyber-attacks. Those efforts have been successful to date and will continue to be assessed and updated moving forward. Vice Chancellor Donna Heath updated the Committee on information technology services strategic planning, including the development of a 5-year plan for fiscal years 2024-2029. Athletics Director Brian Mackin provided an overview of the University Athletics Department, noting that for Fall 2023, UNCG student athletes earned an average GPA of 3.4. Executive Associate Athletics Director and Senior Woman Administrator Jody Smith gave an overview of the University's athletics compliance program.

The meeting concluded with discussion around challenges currently facing athletics programs, including new rules that make it easier for student-athletes to transfer and compete immediately, as well as continuing developments around Name, Image, and Likeness.

University Advancement Committee

Committee Chair Margaret Benjamin reported on the February 20, 2024, meeting of the University Advancement Committee.

The Committee heard an update on the *Light the Way* Campaign. Vice Chancellor Beth Fischer reported that we are \$176.7M toward the \$200M campaign goal. Several units have reached their goals: HHS, Athletics, Weatherspoon Art Museum, College of Arts and Sciences, and the School of Nursing. Currently, there are several large opportunities in the works.

Sam Wagner, Executive Director of Development for Major Gifts, reviewed a fiscal year comparison report. New Pledges are up and there are many opportunities in the works including the annual Believe in the G (BITG) event, which is UNCG's largest new donor acquisition event. It will take place in April. The Committee discussed ways to get involved, including match and challenge gifts, serving as BITG Advocates, and participating in on-campus engagement activities during the event.

The Committee learned about the Donor Experience Program, which provides outreach to young alumni. In the past two years, the program has nearly tripled the number of actively managed donors and generated \$1.1M in donations. It also grows talent in the field of Philanthropy while finding and creating meaningful relationships with the next generation of donors.

Finally, the Committee then convened in closed session to discuss a donor naming proposal. It was approved in open session and recommended to the full Board of Trustees for consideration.

Academic Affairs Committee

Committee Chair Dean Priddy reported on the February 20, 2024, meeting of the Academic Affairs Committee.

The Provost provided updates on a new mentoring program and the Math Help Center. Through the mentoring program, which is aligned with the *Spartans Thrive* QEP, 186 upper-division mentors have been matched with first year student mentees. Six Hundred Thirty-Six first time in college/new transfer student mentorships have been formed (approximately 24% of our newest students). These meaningful connections will lead to a greater sense of community for these students and ultimately have a positive impact on persistence and retention. The Math Center provides campus-wide support for students who need computation and statistical academic tutoring. This year, a greater number of undergraduate students have been hired to provide peer-to-peer tutoring, which is the best practice for our population of first-generation students. Thus far, results are encouraging, particularly in pre-calculus and calculus classes, which are gateway courses for many majors. Students who used the Math Help Center perform better and are more likely to pass their math courses than those who do not.

The Committee also learned that, given the university's Emerging HSI (Hispanic Serving Institution) designation, full Spanish interpretation for all Student Orientation, Advising, and

Registration (SOAR) sessions will be implemented beginning this June, in alignment with the Chancellor's investment in bilingual staff in advising, financial aid, and admissions.

The outcome of a Division of Student Success advising survey were discussed. The survey was intended to identify undergraduate students' opinions on the strengths, weaknesses, successes, and challenges of UNCG academic advising. Responses from the 880 student participants indicate that academic advising plays an important role. Advisors are generally perceived as helpful, approachable, and knowledgeable. Survey responses also revealed that students prefer in-person advising interactions, particularly those who utilize faculty advisors. The results will be used to help improve advising, which will in turn strengthen retention and support efforts.

The Committee also received updates on the Academic Portfolio Review (APR) and the Faculty Realignment Incentive Program (FRIP). An APR teach out working group has been formed and includes a representative from each school or college, the graduate school, and the division of student success. The group is establishing a sunset date for each program identified for discontinuation and will have developed teach out plans for all students by April 1. Regarding the FRIP, 23 eligible faculty have indicated interest in accepting the offer to participate, and another seven offers are outstanding. If all 30 accept, the result will be long term recurring salary savings of an estimated \$2,006,550, plus associated benefits.

Athletics Committee

Committee Chair Ernest Grant reported on the February 20, 2024, meeting of the Finance and Athletics Committee.

The Athletics Committee meeting began with remarks from Softball Head Coach Janelle Breneman, who is in her 12th year at UNCG and is the program's all-time leader in wins.

Under Breneman's guidance, the Spartans have won the last six Southern Conference Regular Season championships and three SoCon tournament titles. She has received the SoCon Coach of the Year award four times.

In addition to the team's success, Coach Breneman's student athletes earned a 3.73 GPA last semester, including eight 4.0s. Beyond the academic support the players receive, they benefit from Breneman's philosophy that her role is to foster growth and development both on and off the field of play.

AD Brian Mackin updated the committee on the status of fall sports, including men's and women's golf, tennis, cross country/track, and basketball. Both basketball teams are heading into the upcoming Southern Conference Tournament in strong standing after successful seasons.

The meeting concluded with an update on fundraising and developments with Name, Image, Likeness regulations since the committee's October 2023 meeting.

Open Session

Action Items

BOT – 1 Consent Agenda

- 1.1 Approval of Minutes – October 12, 2023
- 1.2 Approval of Minutes – October 31, 2023
- 1.3 Acceptance of Completed Projects in Fiscal Year 2022-2023 (FAC – 1)

Hoyle reviewed the three items on the consent agenda; all were included in the trustees' pre-meeting materials. There being no questions or requests to discuss either item individually, he invited a motion to approve the consent agenda. Trustee Grant made the motion, which was seconded by Trustee Coleman. The motion carried unanimously.

Discussion/Action Items

BOT – 2 Southern Association of Colleges and Schools Commission on Colleges (SACSCOC) Accreditation Update

Dr. Jodi Pettazoni, Associate Vice Provost and Director of Assessment, provided an update on the status of the university's ten year SACSCOC accreditation reaffirmation process. The purpose of accreditation is for an institution to demonstrate effectiveness in fulfillment of mission, compliance with SACSCOC requirements, and continuing efforts to enhance the quality of student learning, programs, and services. It is required by the UNC System and by federal regulations regarding student financial aid.

As part of the process, the university prepares and submits narrative responses establishing compliance with the various institutional accreditation standards, which are established by the institutions represented by the SACSCOC, which is a peer focused and peer driven accrediting body. Because UNCG has shown it is stable in leadership and governance and has not had any exceptional actions taken against it, the University was approved for a differentiated review, meaning responses to just 39 of 73 total standards were required. Narrative responses to the 39 standards were submitted to SACSCOC along with *Spartans Thrive*, the University's Quality Enhancement Plan (QEP) focused on improving specific student learning outcomes and student success. SACSCOC conducted an off-site review of the submissions, resulting in a finding that UNCG is compliant with 34 of the 39 standards. For the remaining five, additional information showing compliance was requested and provided.

An on-campus review by a visiting Reaffirmation Committee is scheduled for March 18 to 21, 2024. During that visit, the Committee will meet with representatives across campus to address non-compliance, federal regulations established by the US Department of Education, and governance practices, conduct a deep evaluation of the QEP, and tour on- and off-site campus facilities. The Committee will prepare a report based on their findings and conduct an exit interview detailing those findings. Thereafter, UNCG will address any non-compliance concerns in a response report to be submitted to SACSCOC in August 2024.

The process will culminate with a reaffirmation decision by the SACSCOC Board in December 2024.

BOT – 3 Understanding the UNC System Performance-Based Metrics and their Impact on Institutional Strategic Planning

Dr. Andrew Hamilton, Associate Vice Provost and Dean of Undergraduate Studies, gave a high-level introduction to the UNC System’s performance-based metrics covering the most important factors driving scores in each category, examining UNCG scores relative to the System’s threshold and stretch goals, and discussing how those metrics and goals inform strategic planning at the institutional level.

The University’s strategic plan is grounded in and informed by the System’s strategic plans. From 2017 – 2022, that plan was known as “Higher Expectations.” It set forth five head-count based goals for UNCG: increased low income enrollments, low income completions, five-year graduation rates, and degree efficiency for underrepresented minorities, and meeting critical workforce needs. UNCG consistently performed well under that plan and in 2021 was the only System institution to meet all of its five goals.

That plan was refreshed for the five-year period running 2022- 2027 with the same five goals but using different metrics. Rather than being headcount related, the new metrics are more about effectiveness and efficiency (there are other System metrics but these are close to our mission).

In setting UNCG’s metrics under the refreshed System plan, 2020 data were used to formulate baselines. However, those 2020 numbers represent the high watermark in the university’s history; data supports a conclusion that 2020 was an anomaly, rather than a trend.

Nevertheless, the System assigned five core metrics to UNCG using that data:

- Increased four-year graduation rate (as measured for non-transfer students),
- Increased degree efficiency (the number of degrees awarded per 100 full-time equivalent students over a three-year average),
- Decreased loan debt for First Time in College (FTIC) students,
- Decreased loan debt for transfer students; and
- Decreased education and related expenses (ERE) per degree (complex measure of what the institution spends per degree awarded; the biggest component is instructional salaries).

Taken together, these five metrics ask the University to move students through faster while both they and the institution spend fewer dollars on their degrees and System and State support is diminishing. Simply stated, UNCG is under resourced to meet these metrics, and campus-level options that could be exercised to help meet them conflict with our mission.

Our students are different. They come from different backgrounds, with varying degrees of preparedness, and they lack resources. The majority are from underrepresented minority populations and half are Pell eligible. They rely on financial aid, which leads to more student loan debt. They work while they’re enrolled, which detracts from the time they have to focus on their studies, which in turn impacts success. It also requires that they take and complete fewer hours, which in turn increases the time they need to graduate.

Despite these significant impediments, UNCG is meeting the challenge. We met four of the five metrics and narrowly missed meeting the four-year graduation rate goal. This puts us in the top tier relative to other System institutions.

2022 Outcomes

Baseline, Actual, and Goals	2020 Baseline	2022 Actual	Change	2022 Goals	
				Threshold	Stretch
Four-Year Graduation Rate	41.5%	41.67%	.17	42.76%	46.09%
Undergraduate Degree Efficiency	22.7	23.63	.93	22.95	23.69
First Time Student Debt at Graduation (Nominal)	\$16,612				
Inflation-adjusted—2022 Dollars	\$17,875	\$15,089	-15.59%	-2.67%	-9.00%
Transfer Student Debt at Graduation (Nominal)	\$14,327				
Inflation-Adjusted—2022 Dollars	\$15,416	\$11,686	-24.20%	-2.67%	-9.00%
ERE per Degree (Nominal)	\$61,268				
Inflation-Adjusted—2022 Dollars	\$65,924	\$58,208	-11.70%	0.00%	-8.18%

As measured by 2022 outcomes, UNCG received \$2.4M in performance funding. That sum does not offset the net loss to the University under the new funding model. Nor would the performance funding UNCG would have received had it met all five stretch goals identified under the System Plan.

The goals are ultimately good, and UNCG values accountability, but we must consider them as we are thinking about framing a campus strategic plan for the next several years. We know the University is not going to grow, and the goal of increasing the four-year graduation rate is a non-starter. As such, we will sharpen focus on our students and how they are doing, examine how we reallocate and invest resources, and find ways to incent innovation.

Even as the University has reduced costs, we have seen significant improvements in academic performance and have strong predictors that it will continue. Faculty have done excellent work in responding to the reality of our students’ levels of preparedness post-pandemic. We have made data widely available on the impediments to retention and timely completion, and despite concerns around grade inflation nationally, our data show that faculty are not compromising rigor and that students are responding. We are also carefully examining why students tend to take and complete more than the 120 hours than necessary to graduate as we consider how to improve degree efficiency.

While meeting the new metrics will require that we make some tradeoffs, we will not compromise quality for sake of efficiency, and we will continue to encourage and provide the full collegiate experience that earned UNCG the #1 ranking in North Carolina for student experience. The University’s new strategic plan will provide some collective guidance around what those tradeoffs should be.

Transition to Closed Session

Chair Hoyle noted that the final agenda items before the board required closed session discussion. He reminded all that the only items to be discussed during the closed session were agenda items BOT-4, 5, and 6, and that votes on items BOT-4 and 5 would not take place until the board returned to open session. Hoyle also noted that the livestream of the meeting would remain active while the board convened in closed session.

Thereafter, Hoyle moved to convene in closed session pursuant to Section 143- 318.11(a)(1), (2), and (6) of the North Carolina Open Meetings Law to: prevent the disclosure of information that is privileged or confidential or not considered a public record within the meaning of Chapter 132 of the North Carolina General Statutes; prevent the premature disclosure of an honorary degree, scholarship, prize, or similar award; and consider the qualifications, competence, performance, character, fitness, conditions of appointment or conditions of initial employment of an individual employee or prospective employee.

As seconded by Trustee Phipps, the motion carried.

General Account of Closed Session Discussion

Members Present: George Hoyle, Chair; Mae Douglas, Vice Chair; Linda Sloan, Secretary; Anita Bachmann, Margaret Benjamin, Oita Coleman, Ernest Grant, Dean Priddy, Tim Rice (participated remotely); Tim Sessions, Awa Mbai

Others Present: Chancellor Frank Gilliam; Provost Debbie Storrs; Bob Shea, Vice Chancellor for Finance & Administration; Jerry Blakemore, Vice Chancellor for Institutional Integrity and General Counsel; Kristen Bonatz, Deputy General Counsel; Beth Fischer, Vice Chancellor for University Advancement (BOT-4); Juliette Bianco, Director, Weatherspoon Art Museum (BOT – 4); Jeanne Madorin, Associate Vice Chancellor and Chief Human Resources Officer (BOT – 5 and 6); Waiyi Tse, Chief of Staff; Kelly Harris, Assistant Secretary to the Board of Trustees

BOT - 4 Approval of Donor Naming Proposal

As recommended by the University Advancement Committee, Vice Chancellor Fischer and Weatherspoon Art Museum Director Juliette Bianco presented a naming proposal.

BOT – 5 Faculty Personnel Report dated February 5, 2024

The Board reviewed and discussed a faculty personnel report dated February 5, 2024.

BOT - 6 EHRA Actions Report June to December 2023

The Board received an informational report regarding EHRA actions from June to December 2023. There were no questions or comments about the report.

OPEN SESSION

Following return to open session, Chair Hoyle confirmed that discussion during the closed session was limited to agenda items BOT-4, 5 and 6.

Vote on Closed Session Items

BOT - 4 Approval of Donor Naming Proposal

Chair Hoyle invited a motion to approve the donor naming proposal presented in agenda item BOT – 4. Trustee Grant made the motion, which was seconded by Trustee Phipps. The motion carried.

BOT – 5 Faculty Personnel Report dated February 5, 2024

Chair Hoyle invited a motion to approve the faculty personnel report presented in agenda item BOT- 5. Trustee Grant made the motion, which was seconded by Trustee Benjamin. The motion carried.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:08 am.

Respectfully submitted,

Kelly Harris
Assistant Secretary to the Board of Trustees